Question: Is it true that Hadrat ʿUmar radiyallāhu ʿanhu promulgated the punishment for fornication on his son, Abū Shahmah, and that he died with the last lash as related in Tanqīh al-Qaul fī Sharh Lubāb al-Hadīth of Nawawī rahimahullāh?

Answer: The Hadīth experts do not consider this story to be authentic. In fact, it is fabricated.

Hāfiz Ibn Hajar rahimahullāh refers to this narration as false in al-Isābah. It is learnt from the statements of the scholars that its chain contains ʿAbd al-ʿAzīz ibn al-Hajjāj and Muhammad ibn ʿAlī ibn ʿUmar al-Mudhakkir both of whom are unknown and discarded [as narrators].

ʿAllāmah Suyūtī rahimahullāh labels this narration fabricated in al-Laʾālī al-Masnūʿah:

[illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]

However, the correct story is that he consumed nabīdh after which he personally presented himself before Hadrat ʿAmr ibn al-ʿĀs radiyallāhu ʿanhu, the governor of Egypt, to mete out the punishment to him who then meted it out to him inside his house. Hadrat ʿUmar radiyallāhu ʿanhu reprimanded him [for meting out the punishment in private] and when his son returned to Madīnah, he meted out the punishment a second time to him. His son then fell ill and passed away after one month. This is related in Fath al-Bārī as follows:

[illegible]

Al-Laʾālī al-Masnūʿah also relates this incident as follows:

[illegible]

[illegible].

It is learnt from reliable sources that Hadrat ʿUmar radiyallāhu ʿanhu lashed him in order to discipline him. He lived for a month thereafter, fell ill and passed away. It is wrong to say that he died from the last lash – this is a fabrication.
ʿAllāmah Taqī ad-Dīn Ahmad ibn ʿAlī al-Maqrīzī (d. 845 A.H.) rahimahullāh makes mention of this:

[illegible]
[illegible].

The fact that Hadrat ʿUmar radiyallāhu ʿanhu punished him as a way of disciplining him and his passing away after a month is related in the following books:
.[illegible] [illegible]1424 :[illegible] [illegible]18122 :[illegible] [illegible]1707 :[illegible]

Allāh taʿālā knows best.