

Answer: It is wrong to say that Hadrat Fātimah *radiyallāhu ʿanhā* did not experience the monthly menses. There seems to be a Shīʿah influence to this claim. There could be several reasons for this:

- Fayd al-Qadīr* states:

(Arabic text-p. 135)

.00000 :000000 0000 00000 :0000000 0000 00000000 000 0 [2]

Another narrator by the name of Qāsim ibn Mutayyab is also unreliable. Ibn Hibbān says with reference to him:

.ﻗﺎﺳﻢ ﺑﻦ ﻣﺘﺎﻳﻲﺏ ﻗﺎﺩﻩ ﻓﻲ ﺍﻟﺤﺪﻳﺚ ﻟﻪ ﻣﺎ ﻻ ﻳﺤﺪﺩﻩ ﻟﻪ ﻓﻲ ﺍﻟﺤﺪﻳﺚ [3]

(Arabic text – pp. 135-136)

The dictionary *as-Sihāh* has the following entry:

.ﺍﻟﺸﻴﺦ ﺍﻟﻤﻮﺗﺎﻧﺎﺑﻴ ﻳﻘﻮﻝ ﻓﻲ ﺍﻟﺴﻴﻬﺎﺕ ﻗﺎﺩﻩ ﻓﻲ ﺍﻟﺤﺪﻳﺚ ﻟﻪ ﻣﺎ ﻻ ﻳﺤﺪﺩﻩ ﻟﻪ ﻓﻲ ﺍﻟﺤﺪﻳﺚ [4]

A man is described as Azhar and a woman as Zahrā' when they are fair and have a luminous face.

We learn from the above that this word refers to pure whiteness. Rasūlullāh *sallallāhu ﻋﺎﻟﻴﻬﻲ ﻭﺍﻟﻠﻪ ﻣﺎ ﻟﻠﻪ* is described as:

.ﻗﺎﺩﻩ ﻓﻲ ﺍﻟﺤﺪﻳﺚ ﻟﻪ ﻣﺎ ﻻ ﻳﺤﺪﺩﻩ ﻟﻪ ﻓﻲ ﺍﻟﺤﺪﻳﺚ ﻟﻪ ﻣﺎ ﻻ ﻳﺤﺪﺩﻩ ﻟﻪ ﻓﻲ ﺍﻟﺤﺪﻳﺚ

He was fair-complexioned but not so white as to appear colourless.

It is also unusual because if a woman does not experience the monthly menses, she cannot fall pregnant; she will be barren. We know for a fact that Hadrat Fātimāh *radiyallāhu ﻋﺎﻟﻴﻬﺎ ﻭﺍﻟﻠﻪ ﻣﺎ ﻟﻠﻪ* was not barren. Umm al-Mu'minīn H

a
d
rat 'Ā'ishah
ra
d
iyallāhu □ *anhā*
enjoys superiority over

H
a
d
rat Fā
t
imah
ra
d
iyallāhu ۞ *anhā*
in this regard because she was barren and yet she used to experience the monthly menses. We
therefore cannot understand such a claim. Allāh
ta ۞ *ālā*
knows best.

[1] .5835 : 4422 :

[2].1919 年 239 : 1919 年 239 年

[3] .6843 00000 0 4300 :00000000 000000

[4] .2581 :□□□□□□